Alternative Perspectives on Stabilization Policy
IN THIS CHAPTER, YOU WILL LEARN:

about two policy debates:

1. Should policy be active or passive?
2. Should policy be by rule or discretion?
Question 1:

Should policy be active or passive?
Growth rate of U.S. real GDP

Percent change from 4 quarters earlier

Average growth rate
## Increase in unemployment during recessions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>peak</th>
<th>trough</th>
<th>increase in no. of unemployed persons (millions)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>July 1953</td>
<td>May 1954</td>
<td>2.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aug 1957</td>
<td>April 1958</td>
<td>2.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April 1960</td>
<td>February 1961</td>
<td>1.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December 1969</td>
<td>November 1970</td>
<td>2.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>November 1973</td>
<td>March 1975</td>
<td>3.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January 1980</td>
<td>July 1980</td>
<td>1.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July 1981</td>
<td>November 1982</td>
<td>4.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July 1990</td>
<td>March 1991</td>
<td>1.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March 2001</td>
<td>November 2001</td>
<td>1.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December 2007</td>
<td>June 2009</td>
<td>6.14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Arguments for active policy

- Recessions cause economic hardship for millions of people.
- The Employment Act of 1946: “It is the continuing policy and responsibility of the Federal Government to...promote full employment and production.”
- The model of aggregate demand and supply (Chaps. 10–14) shows how fiscal and monetary policy can respond to shocks and stabilize the economy.
Arguments against active policy

Policies act with long & variable lags, including:

**inside lag:**
the time between the shock and the policy response.
- takes time to recognize shock
- takes time to implement policy, especially fiscal policy

**outside lag:**
the time it takes for policy to affect economy.

*If conditions change before policy’s impact is felt, the policy may destabilize the economy.*
Automatic stabilizers

- **definition:** policies that stimulate or depress the economy when necessary without any deliberate policy change.
- Designed to reduce the lags associated with stabilization policy.
- **Examples:**
  - income tax
  - unemployment insurance
  - welfare
Forecasting the macroeconomy

Because policies act with lags, policymakers must predict future conditions.

Two ways economists generate forecasts:

- **Leading economic indicators (LEI)**
  data series that fluctuate in advance of the economy

- **Macroeconometric models**
  Large-scale models with estimated parameters that can be used to forecast the response of endogenous variables to shocks and policies
The LEI index and real GDP, 1960s

source of LEI data: The Conference Board

annual percentage change


Leading Economic Indicators
Real GDP
The LEI index and real GDP, 1970s

source of LEI data:
The Conference Board

Leading Economic Indicators
Real GDP
The LEI index and real GDP, 1980s

Source of LEI data:
The Conference Board

Leading Economic Indicators
Real GDP

CHAPTER 18  Alternative Perspectives on Stabilization Policy
The LEI index and real GDP, 1990s

source of LEI data: The Conference Board

Leading Economic Indicators
Real GDP
Mistakes forecasting the 1982 recession

Unemployment rate

Forecasting the macroeconomy

Because policies act with lags, policymakers must predict future conditions.

The preceding slides show that the forecasts are often wrong.

This is one reason why some economists oppose policy activism.
The Lucas critique

- Due to Robert Lucas who won Nobel Prize in 1995 for his work on rational expectations.
- Forecasting the effects of policy changes has often been done using models estimated with historical data.
- Lucas pointed out that such predictions would not be valid if the policy change alters expectations in a way that changes the fundamental relationships between variables.
An example of the Lucas critique

- Prediction (based on past experience): An increase in the money growth rate will reduce unemployment.

- The Lucas critique points out that increasing the money growth rate may raise expected inflation, in which case unemployment would not necessarily fall.
The Jury’s out...

Looking at recent history does not clearly answer Question 1:

- It’s hard to identify shocks in the data.
- It’s hard to tell how outcomes would have been different had actual policies not been used.
Question 2:

Should policy be conducted by rule or discretion?
Rules and discretion: Basic concepts

- *Policy conducted by rule:* Policymakers announce in advance how policy will respond in various situations and commit themselves to following through.

- *Policy conducted by discretion:* As events occur and circumstances change, policymakers use their judgment and apply whatever policies seem appropriate at the time.
Arguments for rules

1. Distrust of policymakers and the political process
   - misinformed politicians
   - politicians’ interests sometimes not the same as the interests of society
Arguments for rules

2. The time inconsistency of discretionary policy

- def: A scenario in which policymakers have an incentive to renege on a previously announced policy once others have acted on that announcement.
- Destroys policymakers’ credibility, thereby reducing effectiveness of their policies.
Examples of time inconsistency

1. To encourage investment, govt announces it will not tax income from capital. But once the factories are built, govt reneges in order to raise more tax revenue.
Examples of time inconsistency

2. To reduce expected inflation, the central bank announces it will tighten monetary policy.

But faced with high unemployment, the central bank may be tempted to cut interest rates.
Examples of time inconsistency

3. Aid is given to poor countries contingent on fiscal reforms.

The reforms do not occur, but aid is given anyway, because the donor countries do not want the poor countries’ citizens to starve.
Monetary policy rules

a. Constant money supply growth rate
   ▪ Advocated by monetarists.
   ▪ Stabilizes aggregate demand only if velocity is stable.
Monetary policy rules

a. Constant money supply growth rate

b. Target growth rate of nominal GDP
   - Automatically increase money growth whenever nominal GDP grows slower than targeted; decrease money growth when nominal GDP growth exceeds target.
Monetary policy rules

a. Constant money supply growth rate

b. Target growth rate of nominal GDP

c. Target the inflation rate
   - Automatically reduce money growth whenever inflation rises above the target rate.
   - Many countries’ central banks now practice inflation targeting but allow themselves a little discretion.
Central bank independence

- A policy rule announced by central bank will work only if the announcement is credible.
- Credibility depends in part on degree of independence of central bank.
Inflation and central bank independence

![Graph showing the relationship between average inflation and the index of central bank independence for various countries, including Spain, New Zealand, Italy, United Kingdom, Australia, France/Norway/Sweden, Belgium, Japan, Canada, Netherlands, United States, Switzerland, and Germany.](image-url)
1. Advocates of active policy believe:
   - frequent shocks lead to unnecessary fluctuations in output and employment.
   - fiscal and monetary policy can stabilize the economy.

2. Advocates of passive policy believe:
   - the long & variable lags associated with monetary and fiscal policy render them ineffective and possibly destabilizing.
   - inept policy increases volatility in output, employment.
3. Advocates of discretionary policy believe:
   - discretion gives more flexibility to policymakers in responding to the unexpected.

4. Advocates of policy rules believe:
   - the political process cannot be trusted: Politicians make policy mistakes or use policy for their own interests.
   - commitment to a fixed policy is necessary to avoid time inconsistency and maintain credibility.